




INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL AND ENGINEERING SERVICES

DATE: October 3, 2017

TO: City Commission

THRU: Spencer Shambray, Purchasing Manager

FROM: Reddy Chitepu, P.E., Director 

RE: **Award Recommendation for Bid No. 2017-011**
Painting of the Water Treatment Plant Storage Tanks and Piping

On August 22, 2017, the City of Margate received seven (7) bids for the above referenced project. Two bidders (Shamrock Restoration Services, Inc., and Roof Painting by Hartzell) made calculation errors in their respective bids which were corrected and verified with both the bidders. Attached is the bid tabulation with corrected totals.

DEES staff reviewed the four lowest bids for completeness and conformance to the bid requirements. Based on the review, it was determined that the second and third lowest bidders do not employ a NACE Level 3 certified coating inspector and therefore do not meet the minimum bid requirements. NACE Level 3 certified inspectors are recognized as leaders in the coatings inspection field and are highly skilled and experienced in corrosion, surface preparation, coating mixtures, and test instruments.

Keystone Painting, Inc. (KPI) submitted the lowest bid and employs a NACE level 3 inspector; however, during reference checks, it was determined that Keystone Painting does not have the required experience to perform the scope for the referenced project. KPI's experience, documented in the bid submitted, was limited to painting residential and commercial properties. The bid documents required the Contractor to have previous painting experience at a water treatment plant utilizing the specified product.

Southern Star Contractors, Inc. submitted the fourth lowest bid and met all the bid requirements including having a NACE level 3 inspector on staff; however, the bid submitted is \$152,500 and \$91,498 higher than the lowest and the second lowest bids, respectively.

Shamrock Restoration Services, Inc. (Shamrock), second lowest bidder, previously completed painting projects similar to the requested scope utilizing the specified product including one for City of Tamarac. Staff contacted the City of Tamarac and other references for evaluation and the results were favorable. Except for not employing a NACE level 3 inspector, Shamrock submitted a responsible and responsive bid with the required experience for the project, including favorable references. Shamrock has indicated that they can provide a NACE level 3 inspector as a subcontractor on the project with no change to their bid price.

Per Item # 15 "Award of Contract" of the Instructions to Bidders in the bid documents, it is clearly stated that the award will be based on a bid "which is deemed to be in the best interest of the City as determined in the sole discretion of the City.....reserves the right to

accept or reject any or all bids, parts of bids, to waive formalities in any bid, or to take any other action that is deemed to be in the best interest of the City." Waiving the requirement to have a NACE level 3 inspector on staff and awarding the contract to Shamrock in lieu of Southern Star will allow the City to realize a savings of \$91,498. As such, I recommend awarding the project to Shamrock Restoration Services, Inc., the second lowest bidder, in the amount of \$528,102.00.

The Florida Department of Business and Professional Regulation website shows that Shamrock has an active license without any listed license complaints. The bid documents were signed by a representative that was authorized by the registered agent listed for the firm on The Florida Division of Corporations website.

Enclosure

cc: City Manager
City Attorney

Bid 2017-011
Painting of WTP Storage Tanks and Piping
Bid Tabulation

Item No.	Description	Qty	Unit	Hartzell *		Shamrock*		Keystone		Southern Star		Southland Painting		Amherst Maintenance		SDB Eng. & Constructors	
				Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost
1	Mobilization	1	LS	\$41,250	\$41,250	\$3,957	\$3,957	\$18,000	\$18,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$9,250	\$9,250	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$24,459	\$24,459
2	2 M Concrete Tank	1	LS	\$127,750	\$127,750	\$96,705	\$96,705	\$116,000	\$116,000	\$135,000	\$135,000	\$166,340	\$166,340	\$80,000	\$80,000	\$98,585	\$98,585
3	2 M Concrete Tank - Coral Gate	1	LS	\$127,750	\$127,750	\$104,112	\$104,112	\$116,000	\$116,000	\$135,000	\$135,000	\$180,675	\$180,675	\$80,000	\$80,000	\$107,217	\$107,217
4	Clarifier - Interior Only	2	LS	\$114,000	\$228,000	\$112,348	\$224,696	\$25,500	\$51,000	\$110,000	\$220,000	\$149,000	\$298,000	\$170,000	\$340,000	\$45,065	\$90,130
5	Location 1	1	LS	\$8,340	\$8,340	\$5,238	\$5,238	\$9,000	\$9,000	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$3,175	\$3,175	\$8,000	\$8,000	\$25,603	\$25,603
6	Location 2	1	LS	\$10,500	\$10,500	\$11,531	\$11,531	\$14,000	\$14,000	\$15,000	\$15,000	\$7,130	\$7,130	\$18,000	\$18,000	\$31,822	\$31,822
7	Location 3	1	LS	\$1,808	\$1,808	\$822	\$822	\$7,000	\$7,000	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$1,050	\$1,050	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$24,758	\$24,758
8	Location 4	1	LS	\$4,520	\$4,520	\$875	\$875	\$8,000	\$8,000	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$1,500	\$1,500	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$26,449	\$26,449
9	Location 5	1	LS	\$3,980	\$3,980	\$1,687	\$1,687	\$17,000	\$17,000	\$7,500	\$7,500	\$2,860	\$2,860	\$16,000	\$16,000	\$37,195	\$37,195
10	Location 6	1	LS	\$3,608	\$3,608	\$4,387	\$4,387	\$9,000	\$9,000	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$2,010	\$2,010	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$25,603	\$25,603
11	Location 7	1	LS	\$4,336	\$4,336	\$15,450	\$15,450	\$38,000	\$38,000	\$14,000	\$14,000	\$6,300	\$6,300	\$15,000	\$15,000	\$45,950	\$45,950
12	Location 8	1	LS	\$5,832	\$5,832	\$24,920	\$24,920	\$7,000	\$7,000	\$16,000	\$16,000	\$20,750	\$20,750	\$28,000	\$28,000	\$42,567	\$42,567
13	Location 9	1	LS	\$4,356	\$4,356	\$1,186	\$1,186	\$7,000	\$7,000	\$4,500	\$4,500	\$1,200	\$1,200	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$21,922	\$21,922
14	Location 10	1	LS	\$2,010	\$2,010	\$1,186	\$1,186	\$7,000	\$7,000	\$2,000	\$2,000	\$1,200	\$1,200	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$23,613	\$23,613
15	Location 11	1	LS	\$3,440	\$3,440	\$1,000	\$1,000	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$1,500	\$1,500	\$550	\$550	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$31,822	\$31,822
16	Location 12	1	LS	\$13,640	\$13,640	\$5,250	\$5,250	\$12,000	\$12,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$5,100	\$5,100	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$26,449	\$26,449
	Allowance	1		\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$25,000
	Cost of Indemn.	1		\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100
Totals				\$616,220		\$528,102		\$467,100		\$619,600		\$732,190		\$712,100		\$709,244	

*Reflects Corrected Totals