

500 Australian Avenue South Suite 850 West Palm Beach, FL 33401 Phone: +1 561.746.6900 Fax: +1 561.746.8333 www.chenmoore.com

Date: October 9, 2017

Sent via email JAthias@margatefl.com

City of Margate Department of Environmental & Engineering Services Jeanine Athias, P.E. Engineer 901 NW 66th Avenue, Suite A Margate, FL 33063

Subject: Aerial Utility Crossing Replacements – 2017-020 Bid Evaluation

Dear Ms. Athias:

Chen Moore and Associates (CMA) has conducted a review of the lowest three bids received on October 2nd for the Aerial Utility Crossing Replacements – Bid No. 2017-020. The lowest bidder is Johnson-Davis, Inc. with a total bid of \$589,145.00.

The bid received by Johnson-Davis, Inc. was evaluated which findings indicate that the cost of line items described as "Remove and Dispose of Existing Pipe", "Structural Pipe Support", and "Restore Sod" are significantly higher than the engineer's cost estimate. However, the unit cost for these line items were in line with the average obtained from the lowest three bidders.

The three references submitted by the contractor were verified as part of the bid evaluation and positive feedback was obtained from two references. A third reference could not be contacted.

In conclusion, Johnson-Davis, Inc. received good reviews from references and was identified as the lowest bidder where some unit costs within the bid are higher in comparison to the engineer's cost estimate but in line with the average of the lowest three bidders.

Respectfully Submitted,

CHEN MOORE AND ASSOCIATES

Paula A. Fonseca, P.E.

Senior Engineer



500 Australian Ave South, #850 West Palm Beach, FL 33401 Phone: (561) 281-4480 Fax: (561) 746-8333 www.chenmoore.com

CITY OF MARGATE –Aerial Utility Crossing Replacements BID No. 2017-020 Contractor Reference Check

Date Bid Received: October 2, 2017 **Contractor: Johnson-Davis Inc.**

Reference #1: City of Fort Pierce – Tracey Telle, Assistant City Engineer – (772)-467-3776

Contact Date: October 5, 2017

- 1.) Has the contractor worked with you? Yes
- 2.) <u>In what role? (Reference was PM, Client, Owner, etc.)</u> Owner/Project Manager
- 3.) What projects/type of projects? (Demo, utilities, etc.): Johnson-Davis has constructed many projects within the City of Fort Pierce including:
 - Canal excavation and stabilization projects including box culverts and headwalls
 - Underground utilities (storm drainage, potable water, sanitary sewer)
 - Roadway reconstruction
- 4.) Was the project on time\on budget? Yes
- 5.) Were there any change orders (Owner or Contractor driven)? Yes, owner requested changes due to scope of construction changes.
- 6.) How would you rate them? **Excellent**
- 7.) Would you use them again? Yes, they recently were awarded a 5-year continuing service contract with the city for emergency drainage repairs.
- 8.) Any claims? No
- 9.) General Comments: Johnson-Davis management and field crews are very dedicated and conscientious workers who will provide ideas for cost-saving options to incorporate into projects. The City of Fort Pierce is very happy with the service and quality of work.

Reference #2: Town of Jupiter – Amanda Barnes, Assistant Director Utilities- (561)-741-2537 Contact Date: October 2, 2017

1.) Has the contractor worked with you? Yes



500 Australian Ave South, #850 West Palm Beach, FL 33401 Phone: (561) 281-4480 Fax: (561) 746-8333

www.chenmoore.com

- 2.) <u>In what role? (Reference was PM, Client, Owner, etc.)</u> **General contracting, multiple** projects, underground water main emergency work, underground utility.
 - 3.) What projects/type of projects? (Demo, utilities, etc.) Multiple projects, underground water main, emergency work, underground utility, replacement of existing water mains, drainage structures, repairs, infrastructure, replacement of large meters, relocation of piping.
 - 4.) Was the project on time\on budget? Yes, on time and on budget
 - 5.) Were there any change orders (Owner or Contractor driven)? Yes, they were typically owner initiated.
 - 6.) How would you rate them? 9
 - 7.) Would you use them again? Yes
 - 8.) Any claims? No
 - 9.) <u>General Comments:</u> Good contractors, they do excellent work, very responsive to our needs, and very responsible.

Reference #3: Cheney Brothers— Warren Newell, Director of Development — (561)-845-4700 Contact Date: Reference could not be contacted via phone or e-mail as of 10/9/2017

- 1.) Has the contractor worked with you?
- 2.) <u>In what role? (Reference was PM, Client, Owner, etc.):</u>
- 3.) What projects/type of projects? (Demo, utilities, etc.):
- 4.) Was the project on time\on budget?
- 5.) Were there any change orders (Owner or Contractor driven)?
- 6.) How would you rate them?
- 7.) Would you use them again?
- 8.) Any claims?
- 9.) General Comments:

BID 2017-020 AERIAL UTILITY CROSSING REPLACEMENTS

BID TABULATION ITEM JOHNSON DAVIS, INC. C & W PIPIELINE, INC. INTERCOUNTY ENGINEERING, INC. DESCRIPTION UNIT QUANTITY EXTENDED PRICE UNIT PRICE EXTENDED PRICE UNIT PRICE EXTENDED PRICE No **UNIT PRICE** 28,000,00 1 **BONDS AND INSURANCE** LS 14.000.00 \$ 14,000.00 28,000.00 27.600.00 27,600.00 MOBILIZATION LS 1 27,000.00 \$ 27,000.00 115,000.00 \$ 115,000.00 54,000.00 \$ 54,000.00 2 MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC LS 18,000.00 18,000.00 43,000.00 43,000.00 25,000.00 25,000.00 3 PERMIT FEES 15,000.00 \$ ΑL 15,000.00 15,000.00 15,000.00 15,000.00 \$ 15,000.00 SITE 3 WATER MAIN REPLACEMENT REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF EXISTING PIPE UP TO 12" DIAMETER 71 40.00 \$ 2,840.00 \$ 22.00 \$ 1,562.00 100.00 \$ 7,100.00 LF \$ FURNISH AND INSTALL 8" DIP WM (FLANGED WITH HIGH PERFORMANCE COATING #N/A 71 350.00 \$ 24,850.00 220.00 \$ 15,620.00 225.00 \$ 15,975.00 6 WHEN ABOVE GROUND) FURNISH AND INSTALL WATER MAIN FITTINGS LB 880 3.00 \$ 2,640.00 3.00 \$ 2,640.00 11.00 9,680.00 CONNECT TO EXISTING PIPE EΑ 4,000.00 8,000.00 3,500.00 7,000.00 900.00 1,800.00 2 EΑ 2,000.00 \$ 2,000.00 4,500.00 4,500.00 3,100.00 \$ 3,100.00 9 FURNISH & INSTALL 8" GATE VALVE 1 10 STRUCTURAL PIPE SUPPORT LS 1 4,000.00 4,000.00 6,000.00 6,000.00 3,700.00 \$ 3,700.00 CONSTRUCT MISCELLANEOUS CONCRETE LS 3,000.00 3,000.00 1,850.00 1,850.00 5,000.00 5,000.00 11 12 CONCRETE SIDEWALK RESTORATION 4" THICK SY 20 100.00 2,000.00 40.00 800.00 220.00 4,400.00 RESTORE SOD LS 5,000.00 5,000.00 1,500.00 3,000.00 13 1,500.00 3,000.00 ASPHALT CONCRETE PAVEMENT RESTORATION SY 100.00 900.00 140.00 1,260.00 225.00 2,025.00 14 SITE 7 WATER MAIN REPLACEMENT 15 REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF EXISTING PIPE UP TO 12" DIAMETER LF 72 40.00 \$ 2,880.00 22.00 \$ 1,584.00 100.00 \$ 7,200.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL 12" DIP WM (FLANGED WITH HIGH PERFORMANCE 350.00 \$ 235.00 \$ 450.00 \$ 16 LF 25.200.00 \$ 16.920.00 32.400.00 COATING WHEN ABOVE GROUND) 72 FURNISH AND INSTALL PRESSURE MAIN FITTINGS 1,800.00 17 LB 600 3.00 1,800.00 3.00 9.00 5,400.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL AIR RELEASE VALVE 2,000.00 2,000.00 9,500.00 9,500.00 1,500.00 1,500.00 18 EΑ 1 19 FURNISH AND INSTALL NEW FAN GUARD EΑ 2 2.500.00 5.000.00 4.500.00 9.000.00 2.600.00 5,200.00 CONNECT TO EXISTING PIPE EΑ 2 4,000.00 8,000.00 10,000.00 20,000.00 1,000.00 2,000.00 20 STRUCTURAL SUPPORT FOR PIPE LS 1 5,000.00 5,000.00 6,000.00 3,200.00 3,200.00 21 6,000.00 MISCELLANEOUS CONCRETE AND RESTORATION 5,000.00 5,000.00 1,850.00 1,850.00 2,000.00 2,000.00 23 RESTORE SOD LS 3,000.00 3,000.00 1,500.00 1,500.00 1,000.00 1,000.00 1 REMOVE AND REPLACE FENCE LF 20.00 1,200.00 36.00 2,160.00 25.00 1,500.00 24 60 SITE 10 WATER MAIN REPLACEMENT 25 REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF EXISTING PIPE UP TO 12" DIAMETER LF 120 30.00 \$ 3,600.00 22.00 \$ 2,640.00 100.00 \$ 12,000.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL 10" DIP WM (FLANGED WITH HIGH PERFORMANCE LF 300.00 \$ 36,000.00 250.00 \$ 30,000.00 240.00 \$ 28,800.00 26 120 COATING WHEN ABOVE GROUND) 2.460.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL WATER MAIN FITTINGS LB 820 3.00 2,460.00 3.00 9.00 7,380.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL AIR RELEASE VALVE 9,500.00 1,200.00 2,000.00 2,000.00 9,500.00 1,200.00 28 EΑ 1 29 FURNISH AND INSTALL GATE VALVE EΑ 1 2.500.00 2.500.00 4.800.00 4.800.00 4.000.00 4.000.00 30 CONNECT TO EXISTING PIPE EΑ 2 4,000.00 8,000.00 5,500.00 11,000.00 1,500.00 3,000.00 31 CORE DRILLING THROUGH CONCRETE LS 1 2,500.00 2,500.00 3,500.00 3,500.00 4,000.00 4,000.00 MISCELLANEOUS CONCRETE AND RESTORATION 3,000.00 3,000.00 1,850.00 5,000.00 5,000.00 LS 1,850.00 33 RESTORE CONCRETE SIDEWALK SY 28 100.00 3,000.00 60.00 1,800.00 220.00 6,600.00 **RESTORE SOD** LS 3,000.00 3,000.00 1,500.00 1,500.00 6,500.00 6,500.00 34 1 REMOVE AND REPLACE FENCE LF 80 1,600.00 2,880.00 2,560.00 35 20.00 36.00 32.00 36 TREE REMOVAL AND/OR RELOCATION EΑ 400.00 800.00 500.00 1,000.00 1,000.00 2,000.00 SITE 11 WATER MAIN REPLACEMENT REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF EXISTING PIPE UP TO 12" DIAMETER LF 95 40.00 \$ 3,800.00 22.00 \$ 2,090.00 85.00 \$ 8,075.00 37 URNISH AND INSTALL 6" DIP WM (FLANGED WITH HIGH PERFORMANCE COATING LF 38 125 300.00 \$ 28,500.00 210.00 \$ 19,950.00 245.00 \$ 23,275.00 WHEN ABOVE GROUND) FURNISH AND INSTALL WATER MAIN FITTINGS LB 3.00 \$ 1,200.00 3,600.00 39 400 1,200.00 3.00 \$ 9.00 40 FURNISH AND INSTALL AIR RELEASE VALVE - ON THE SIDE OF PIPE EΑ 1 2.000.00 2.000.00 9.500.00 9.500.00 900.00 900.00 CONNECT TO EXISTING PIPE 41 EΑ 3,500.00 7,000.00 3,500.00 7,000.00 550.00 1,100.00 2 42 STRUCTURAL SUPPORT FOR PIPE LS 3,000.00 3,000.00 6,000.00 6,000.00 1,800.00 1,800.00 43 CORE DRILLING THROUGH CONCRETE LS 4,000.00 4,000.00 3,000.00 3,000.00 2,000.00 2,000.00 MISCELLANEOUS CONCRETE AND RESTORATION LS 3,000.00 3,000.00 1,850.00 1,850.00 3,200.00 3,200.00 1 RESTORE CONCRETE SIDEWALK 45 SY 100.00 1,600.00 60.00 960.00 120.00 1,920.00 16 46 RESTORE SOD LS 4.000.00 4,000.00 1.500.00 1,500.00 4.500.00 4,500.00 SITE 13 WATER MAIN AND FORCE MAIN REPLACEMENT 47 REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF EXISTING PIPE UP TO 12" DIAMETER LF 240 20.00 \$ 5,000.00 \$ 22.00 \$ 5,500.00 \$ 110.00 \$ 27,500.00 URNISH AND INSTALL 6" DIP WM (FLANGED WITH HIGH PERFORMANCE COATING 48 WHEN ABOVE GROUND) LF 115 250.00 \$ 33,750.00 205.00 \$ 27,675.00 250.00 \$ 33,750.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL 8" DIP FM (FLANGED WITH HIGH PERFORMANCE COATING 49 LF 375.00 \$ 235.00 27,025.00 400.00 46,000.00 WHEN ABOVE GROUND) 125 43,125.00 \$ \$ 50 FURNISH AND INSTALL WATER & FORCE MAIN FITTINGS LB 1000 4.00 4,000.00 3.00 3,000.00 15.00 15,000.00 51 FURNISH AND INSTALL AIR RELEASE VALVE EΑ 2,000.00 4,000.00 9,500.00 \$ 19,000.00 3,000.00 6,000.00 2 FURNISH AND INSTALL 6" GATE VALVE EΑ 1,500.00 1,500.00 3,800.00 4,000.00 4,000.00 52 3,800.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL 8" PLUG VALVE EΑ 1 5,000.00 5,000.00 6,850.00 6,850.00 4,200.00 4,200.00 53 4,500.00 18,000.00 14,000.00 1,000.00 4,000.00 54 CONNECT TO EXISTING PIPE EΑ 4 3,500.00 STRUCTURAL SUPPORT FOR PIPE 4,000.00 4,000.00 6,000.00 6,000.00 6,500.00 6,500.00 55 LS 1 56 MISCELLANEOUS CONCRETE AND RESTORATION LS 1 3.000.00 3.000.00 1.850.00 1.850.00 7.500.00 7.500.00 57 RESTORE CONCRETE SIDEWALK SY 41 100.00 4,500.00 60.00 \$ 2,700.00 120.00 5,400.00 58 REMOVE AND REPLACE FENCE LF 60 20.00 1,200.00 24.00 \$ 1,440.00 35.00 2,100.00 LS RESTORE SOD 5,000.00 5,000.00 1,500.00 1,500.00 6,500.00 6,500.00 SITE 18 WATER MAIN AND FORCE MAIN REPLACEMENT 20.00 S 4,800.00 22.00 \$ 5,280.00 100.00 \$ 24,000.00 60 REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF EXISTING PIPE UP TO 12" DIAMETER LF 217 \$ FURNISH AND INSTALL 10" DIP WM (FLANGED WITH HIGH PERFORMANCE 61 COATING WHEN ABOVE GROUND) 37.800.00 LF 131 270.00 \$ \$ 225.00 \$ 31,500.00 135.00 \$ 18,900.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL 6" DIP FM (FLANGED WITH HIGH PERFORMANCE COATING 62 20.000.00 WHEN ABOVE GROUND) LF 320.00 \$ 32,000.00 200.00 325.00 32,500.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL WATER & FORCE MAIN FITTINGS LB 2700 10,800.00 3.00 8,100.00 10.00 27,000.00 63 4.00 FURNISH AND INSTALL AIR RELEASE VALVE 1,500.00 1,500.00 9,500.00 9,500.00 2,200.00 2,200.00 64 EΑ 1 FURNISH AND INSTALL AIR RELEASE VALVE - ON THE SIDE OF PIPE 10.000.00 10.000.00 2.600.00 65 EΑ 1 3.000.00 3.000.00 2.600.00 66 CONNECT TO EXISTING PIPE EΑ 3,000.00 12,000.00 3,500.00 14,000.00 1,500.00 6,000.00 3,200.00 67 STRUCTURAL SUPPORT FOR PIPE LS 1 4,000.00 4,000.00 3,200.00 7,000.00 7,000.00 CORE DRILLING THROUGH CONCRETE LS 3,000.00 3,000.00 1,800.00 1,800.00 4,500.00 4,500.00 68 CONSTRUCT MISCELLANEOUS CONCRETE 3,000.00 3,000.00 1,850.00 1,850.00 17,000.00 17,000.00 69 LS 70 CONCRETE SIDEWALK RESTORATION 3,600.00 100.00 6,000.00 60.00 150.00 9,000.00 LS 5.000.00 \$ 71 RESTORE SOD 5,000.00 1,800.00 \$ 1,800.00 3,500.00 \$ 3,500.00 72 ASPHALT CONCRETE PAVEMENT RESTORATION SY 42 100.00 \$ 4,200.00 48.00 \$ 2,016.00 125.00 \$ 5,250.00 15,000.00 ALLOWANCE 15,000.00 \$ 15,000.00 15,000.00 \$ 15,000.00 \$ 15,000.00 \$ 1 COST OF INDEMNIFICATION 100.00 \$ 100.00 100.00 \$ 100.00 \$ 100.00 \$ 100.00 1. This item only to be used with Owner's approval

TOTALS 589.145.00 688,112.00 \$ 715,190.00